Introduction to

Controlled Vocabularies

Terminology for Art, Architecture, and Other Cultural Works

First edition

Patricia Harpring

Murtha Baca, Series Editor

Published by the Getty Research Institute

The Getty Research Institute Publications Program

Thomas W. Gaehtgens, *Director, Getty Research Institute* Gail Feigenbaum, *Associate Director*

Introduction to Controlled Vocabularies: Terminology for Art, Architecture, and Other Cultural Works

Lauren Edson, *Manuscript Editor*Elizabeth Zozom, *Production Coordinator*Designed by Hespenheide Design, Newbury Park, California
Printed and bound by Odyssey Press, Inc., Gonic, New Hampshire

© 2010 J. Paul Getty Trust

Published by the Getty Research Institute, Los Angeles

Getty Publications Gregory M. Britton, *Publisher* 1200 Getty Center Drive, Suite 500 Los Angeles, California 90049-1682 www.getty.edu

14 13 12 11 10 5 4 3 2 1

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Harpring, Patricia.

Introduction to controlled vocabularies: terminology for art, architecture, and other cultural works / Patricia Harpring. p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-1-60606-018-6 (pbk.)

- 1. Subject headings—Cultural property. 2. Subject headings—Art.
- 3. Subject headings—Architecture. 4. Information retrieval. I. Title. Z695.1.C85H37 2010

025.4'7—dc22

Cover: The story of the Tower of Babel (Genesis 11) was an allegory to explain why different societies spoke different languages (in addition to the obvious warnings against pride toward the deity and urban evils). Babel was a city in Babylon, where after the great flood, humanity was united in one large urban center, speaking a single language. In their pride, the inhabitants began construction of the Tower of Babel, with the intention of reaching the clouds of heaven. Their arrogant plan was foiled by God, who scattered them across the earth and confused their language so they could no longer understand each other.

Draftsman: Lieven Cruyl (Flemish, ca. 1640–ca. 1720); etcher: Coenraet Decker (Dutch, 1651–1685); *Tower of Babel;* etching; folio height 39 cm (15¾ inches); in Athanasius Kircher (German, 1601/1602–1680); *Athanasii Kircheri e Soc. Jesu Turris Babel*; published: Amsterdam: Ex officina Janssonio-Waesbergianna, 1679; Research Library; The Getty Research Institute (Los Angeles, California); 85-B16716-pl.[2].

Back cover: Antoine Babuty Desgodets, after George Marshall, The Temple of Vesta at Tivoli (detail). See fig. 24.

Contents

x	Fo	rewo	rd		
xii	Acknowledgments				
1		1. Controlled Vocabularies in Context			
2		1.1.	What A	re Cultural Works?	
2			1.1.1.	Fine Arts	
3			1.1.2.	Architecture	
3			1.1.3.	Other Visual Arts	
3		1.2.	Creator	s of Art Information	
3			1.2.1.	Museums	
4			1.2.2.	Visual Resources Collections	
5				Libraries	
6					
6			1.2.5.	Special Collections Archival Collections	
7			1.2.6.	Private Collections	
7			1.2.7.	Scholars	
7		1.3.	Standar	ds for Art Information	
8			1.3.1.	Standards for the Creation of Vocabularies	
9			1.3.2.	Issues in Sharing Data	
12	2.	Wha	at Are C	ontrolled Vocabularies?	
12				e of Controlled Vocabularies	
12				Information and Controlled Information	
13			2.2.1.	Display Information with Controlled Vocabularies	
14			2.2.2.	Controlled Vocabularies vs. Controlled Format	
16		2.3.	Types o	f Controlled Vocabularies	
16				Relationships in General	
18				Subject Heading Lists	
19				.1. Other Headings	
19			2.3.3.	Controlled Lists	
20			2.3.4.	Synonym Ring Lists	
21				Authority Files	
22				Taxonomies	
23				Alphanumeric Classification Schemes	
24			2.3.8.	Thesauri	
24			2.3.9.	Ontologies	
26			2.3.10.	Folksonomies	
27	3.	Rela	tionship	s in Controlled Vocabularies	
27			_	ence Relationships	
27			3.1.1.	Synonyms	

20	3.1.1.1. Lexical Variants
29 30	
-	3.1.1.2. Historical Name Changes
30	3.1.1.3. Differences in Language
32	3.1.2. Near Synonyms
33	3.1.3. Preferred Terms
33	3.1.4. Homographs
35	3.1.4.1. Qualifiers
36	3.1.4.1.1. How to Choose a Qualifier for a Term
36	3.1.4.2. Other Ways to Disambiguate Names
37	3.2. Hierarchical Relationships
37	3.2.1. Whole/Part Relationships
38	3.2.2. Genus/Species Relationships
39	3.2.3. Instance Relationships
40	3.2.4. Facets and Guide Terms
41	3.2.5. Polyhierarchies
42	3.3. Associative Relationships
43	3.3.1. Types of Associative Relationships
45	3.3.2. When to Make Associative Relationships
40	4 W 1 1 + C C L 101 + .
49	4. Vocabularies for Cultural Objects
49	4.1. Types of Vocabulary Terms
51	4.2. The Getty Vocabularies
52 53	4.2.1. Art & Architecture Thesaurus (AAT)
53	4.2.1.1. Scope
54	4.2.1.1.1. Facets and Hierarchies in the <i>AAT</i>
56	4.2.1.2.1 What Constitutes a Term in the <i>AAT</i> ?
56	4.2.1.2.1. Warrant for a Term
57	4.2.1.2.2. Discrete Concepts
57	4.2.1.3. What Is Excluded from the <i>AAT</i> ?
57	4.2.1.4. Fields in the AAT
59	4.2.2. Getty Thesaurus of Geographic Names (TGN)
59	
	4.2.2.1. Scope
60	4.2.2.1.1. Nations, Cities, Archaeological Sites
60 60	4.2.2.1.1. Nations, Cities, Archaeological Sites 4.2.2.1.2. Physical Features
60 60	4.2.2.1.1. Nations, Cities, Archaeological Sites4.2.2.1.2. Physical Features4.2.2.1.3. Places That No Longer Exist
60 60 60	4.2.2.1.1. Nations, Cities, Archaeological Sites4.2.2.1.2. Physical Features4.2.2.1.3. Places That No Longer Exist4.2.2.2. What Is Excluded from the <i>TGN</i>?
60 60 60 60	 4.2.2.1.1. Nations, Cities, Archaeological Sites 4.2.2.1.2. Physical Features 4.2.2.1.3. Places That No Longer Exist 4.2.2.2. What Is Excluded from the <i>TGN</i>? 4.2.2.2.1. Built Works
60 60 60 60 60	 4.2.2.1.1. Nations, Cities, Archaeological Sites 4.2.2.1.2. Physical Features 4.2.2.1.3. Places That No Longer Exist 4.2.2.2. What Is Excluded from the TGN? 4.2.2.2.1. Built Works 4.2.2.2.2. Cultural and Political Groups
60 60 60 60 60 60	 4.2.2.1.1. Nations, Cities, Archaeological Sites 4.2.2.1.2. Physical Features 4.2.2.1.3. Places That No Longer Exist 4.2.2.2. What Is Excluded from the TGN? 4.2.2.2.1. Built Works 4.2.2.2.2. Cultural and Political Groups 4.2.2.3. Fields in the TGN
60 60 60 60 60	 4.2.2.1.1. Nations, Cities, Archaeological Sites 4.2.2.1.2. Physical Features 4.2.2.1.3. Places That No Longer Exist 4.2.2.2. What Is Excluded from the TGN? 4.2.2.2.1. Built Works 4.2.2.2.2. Cultural and Political Groups

63		4.2.3.1.1. Artists
63		4.2.3.1.2. Architects
63		4.2.3.1.3. Non-Artists
63		4.2.3.1.4. Workshops and Families
64		4.2.3.1.5. Anonymous and Unknown Artists
64		4.2.3.1.6. Amateur Artists
64		4.2.3.2. What Is Excluded from the <i>ULAN</i> ?
65		4.2.3.3. Fields in the <i>ULAN</i>
65		4.2.4. Cultural Objects Name Authority (CONA)
65		4.2.4.1. Scope
67		4.2.4.1.1. Built Works
67		4.2.4.1.2. Movable Works
68		4.2.4.2. What Is Excluded from CONA?
68		4.2.4.3. Fields in <i>CONA</i>
68		4.2.5. Conservation Thesaurus (CT)
71	4.3.	Chenhall's Nomenclature for Museum Cataloging
71		4.3.1. Organization and Scope of <i>Nomenclature for</i>
		Museum Cataloging
71		4.3.2. Terms in Nomenclature for Museum Cataloging
72		4.3.3. Nomenclature for Museum Cataloging vs. the AAT
73	4.4.	Library of Congress Authorities
74		4.4.1. Library of Congress/NACO Authority File (LCNAF)
75		4.4.2. Library of Congress Subject Headings (LCSH)
76	4.5.	Thesaurus for Graphic Materials (TGM)
77		4.5.1. Scope of the <i>TGM</i>
77		4.5.2. The <i>TGM</i> vs. the <i>AAT</i>
80	4.6.	Iconclass
80		4.6.1. Structure and Scope of <i>Iconclass</i>
		I
83	5. Usin	g Multiple Vocabularies
83		Interoperability of Vocabularies
84		Maintenance of Mappings
84		Methods of Achieving Interoperability
85		5.3.1. Direct Mapping
86		5.3.2. Switching Vocabulary
86		5.3.3. Factors for Successful Interoperability of
		Vocabularies
89		5.3.4. Semantic Mapping
90	5 4	Interoperability across Languages
90	2.1.	5.4.1. Issues of Multilingual Terminology
92		5.4.2. Dominant Languages
92	5.5	Satellite and Extension Vocabularies
14	<i>ا</i> رون	Outcome and Datension vocabulaties

6. Local Authorities 94 6.1. Which Fields Should Be Controlled? 96 97 6.2. Structure of the Authority 97 6.3. Unique IDs in the Authority 99 6.4. Person/Corporate Body Authority 6.4.1. Sources for Terminology 101 102 6.4.2. Suggested Fields 106 6.5. Place/Location Authority 107 6.5.1. Sources for Terminology 108 6.5.2. Suggested Fields 113 6.6. Generic Concept Authority 6.6.1. Sources for Terminology 114 115 6.6.2. Suggested Fields 119 6.7. Subject Authority 6.7.1. Sources for Terminology 121 122 6.7.2. Suggested Fields 130 6.8. Source Authority 6.8.1. Sources for Terminology 130 130 6.8.2. Suggested Fields 133 7. Constructing a Vocabulary or Authority 133 7.1. General Criteria for the Vocabulary 133 7.1.1. Local or Broader Use 134 7.1.2. Purpose of the Vocabulary 7.1.3. Scope of the Vocabulary 134 135 7.1.4. Maintaining the Vocabulary 7.2. Data Model and Rules 135 7.2.1. Established Standards 135 136 7.2.2. Logical Focus of the Record 136 7.2.3. Data Structure 7.2.4. Controlled Fields vs. Free-Text Fields 137 137 7.2.5. Minimum Information 7.2.6. Editorial Rules 138 138 7.3. Imprecise Information 140 7.4. Rules for Constructing a Vocabulary 140 7.4.1. Establishing Terms 141 7.4.1.1. Capitalization 7.4.2. Regulating Hierarchical Relationships 141 142 7.4.2.1. Mixing Relationships 142 7.4.2.2. Incorporating Facets and Guide Terms

144	7.5. Displaying a Controlled Vocabulary
144	7.5.1. Display for Various Types of Users
145	7.5.2. Technical Considerations
145	7.5.2.1. Display Independent of Database Design
145	7.5.3. Characteristics of Displays
146	7.5.3.1. Format of Display
146	7.5.3.2. Documentation
147	7.5.3.3. Displaying Hierarchies
147	7.5.3.3.1. Indentation vs. Notations
149	7.5.3.3.2. Alternative Hierarchical Displays
149	7.5.3.3.3. Display of Polyhierarchy
152	7.5.3.3.4. Sorting of Siblings
153	7.5.3.3.5. Faceted Displays and Guide Terms
154	7.5.3.3.6. Classification Notation or Line Number
155	7.5.3.4. Full Record Display
155	7.5.3.5. Displaying Equivalence and Associative
	Relationships
157	7.5.3.5.1. Permuted Lists and Inverted Forms
157	7.5.3.5.2. Displaying Homographs
158	7.5.3.5.3. Sorting and Alphabetizing Terms
159	7.5.3.5.4. Diacritics in Sorting
160	7.5.3.5.5. Display of Diacritics
160	7.5.3.6. Search Results Displays
160	7.5.3.6.1. Headings or Labels
162	7.5.3.6.2. Ascending or Descending Order of Parents
162	7.5.3.6.3. Displaying the User's Search Term
164	7.5.3.7. Pick Lists
165	8. Indexing with Controlled Vocabularies
165	8.1. Technical Issues of Indexing
165	8.1.1. Availability of Indexing Terms to the Cataloger
167	8.2. Methodologies for Indexing
167	8.2.1. Indexing Display Information
167	8.2.2. When Fields Do Not Display to End Users
168	8.2.3. Specificity and Exhaustivity
168	8.2.3.1. Specificity Related to the Authority Records
169	8.2.3.2. General and Specific Terms
170	8.2.3.3. Preferred or Variant Terms
170	8.2.3.4. How Many Terms
170	8.2.3.4.1. How to Establish Core Elements

171	8.2.3.4.2. Minimal Records
171	8.2.3.4.3. Missing Information
172	8.2.3.5. Size and Focus of the Collection
172	8.2.3.5.1. Different Works Require Different
	Indexing
172	8.2.3.5.2. Cataloging in Phases
172	8.2.3.5.3. Indexing Groups vs. Items
173	8.2.3.5.4. Expertise of End Users
174	8.2.3.5.5. Expertise of Catalogers and Indexers
174	8.2.4. Indexing Uncertain Information
176	8.2.4.1. Knowable vs. Unknowable Information
176	8.2.4.1.1. Knowable Information
176	8.2.4.1.2. Debated Information
177	9. Retrieval Using Controlled Vocabularies
177	9.1. Identifying the Focus of Retrieval
178	9.2. User Intervention or Behind the Scenes
178	9.2.1. Retrieval by Browsing
181	9.2.2. Retrieval via Search Box
182	9.2.3. Retrieval by Querying in a Database
185	9.2.3.1. Reports and Ad Hoc Queries of the Database
186	9.2.4. Querying across Multiple Databases
186	9.2.5. Seeding Tags with Vocabulary Terms
187	9.3. Processing Vocabulary Data for Retrieval
188	9.3.1. Know Your Audience
188	9.3.2. Using Names for Retrieval
189	9.3.3. Truncating Names
190	9.3.4. Keyword Searching
191	9.3.5. Normalizing Terms
192	9.3.5.1. Case Insensitivity in Retrieval
193	9.3.5.2. Compound Terms and Names in Retrieval
193	9.3.5.3. Diacritics and Punctuation in Retrieval
194	9.3.5.4. Phonetic Matching
195	9.3.5.5. Singulars and Plurals in Retrieval
196	9.3.5.6. Abbreviations
196	9.3.5.7. Trunk Names
197	9.3.5.8. Form and Syntax of the Name
197	9.3.5.8.1. First and Last Names
197	9.3.5.8.2. Pivoting on the Comma
198	9.3.5.8.3. Multiple Commas

199	9.3.5.9. Articles and Prepositions
200	9.3.6. Reserved Character Sets
201	9.3.7. Stop Lists
201	9.3.8. Boolean Operators
201	9.3.9. Context of Terms in Retrieval
202	9.3.9.1. Qualifiers in Retrieval
202	9.3.9.2. Hierarchical Relationships in Retrieva
204	9.3.9.3. Associative Relationships in Retrieval
204	9.4. Other Data Used in Retrieval
204	9.4.1. Unique Identifiers as Search Criteria
205	9.4.2. Other Vocabulary Data Used in Retrieval
205	9.5. Results Lists
207	Appendix: Selected Vocabularies and Other Sources for Terminology
210	Glossary

Selected Bibliography

239

Foreword

The Getty Vocabulary Program has devoted almost three decades to building thesauri that can be used as knowledge bases, cataloging and documentation tools, and online search assistants. In addition to building tools for use by art and cultural heritage professionals and the general public, we also provide training opportunities and educational materials on how to build and implement controlled vocabularies. Part of our mission as an institution devoted to research and education is to share our knowledge and expertise with the international art and cultural heritage communities in their broadest sense.

Elisa Lanzi's *Introduction to Vocabularies*, which appeared in print in 1998 and was updated in an online version in 2000, offers a general overview of vocabularies for art and material culture. *Introduction to Controlled Vocabularies* is a much more detailed "how-to" guide to building controlled vocabulary tools, cataloging and indexing cultural materials with terms and names from controlled vocabularies, and using vocabularies in search engines and databases to enhance discovery and retrieval in the online environment.

"How forceful are right words!" is written in Job 6:25. The King James Version of the Bible uses the word *forcible*, meaning "forceful" or "powerful," instead. In the online environment, words have the power to lead users to the information resources that they seek. But we should not force users to know what we consider to be the "right" word or name in order for them to be able to obtain the best search results.

We recognize that a single concept can be expressed by more than one word, and that a single word can express more than one concept. Words can change over time and take a variety of forms, and they can be translated into many languages. A carefully constructed controlled vocabulary provides catalogers and others who create descriptive metadata with the "right" or "preferred" name or term to use in describing collections and other resources, but it also clusters together all of the synonyms, orthographic and grammatical variations, historical forms, and even in some cases "wrong" names or terms in order to enhance access for a broad range of users without constraining them to the use of the "right" term. With millions of searches being

Foreword xi

conducted by millions of users each day via Web search engines and in proprietary databases, the power of words is a crucial factor in providing access to the wealth of information resources now available in electronic form. We hope that this book will provide organizations and individuals who wish to enhance access to their collections and other online resources with a practical tool for creating and implementing vocabularies as reference tools, sources of documentation, and powerful enhancements for online searching.

Murtha Baca, Getty Research Institute

Acknowledgments

I wish to thank Murtha Baca for her lasting support, thoughtful guidance, and expert editing. I am also grateful to Joan Cobb, Gregg Garcia, Marcia Zeng, and Karim Boughida, who provided invaluable advice on the technical aspects of this book. I extend sincere thanks to the indefatigable Getty Vocabulary Program editors Antonio Beecroft, Ming Chen, Robin Johnson, and Jonathan Ward, who proofed the manuscript and provided important feedback.

Finally, thanks go to the scores of earlier vocabulary editors and users of the Getty vocabularies, who have provided countless insights and advice over the last three decades.

Patricia Harpring